

Jack Cole, Chair
Information Security System Assurance Architecture (ISSAA) WG
16 September 2005

Jack Cole:

As the IEEE Program Manager assigned to the Mandatory Editorial Coordination (MEC) of your preballoted draft standard, it is my pleasure to review IEEE P1700/D17.

In the interest of facilitating the swift promotion of your draft standard, I share with you now the following comments, organized into three sections:

1. [Items/issues that shall be resolved before the ballot begins](#)
2. [Items/issues that shall be resolved before the final recirculation](#)
3. [Items/issues that should be resolved before submission to RevCom \(not mandatory to secure approval of the project\)](#)

[Please note that professional editing takes place once the document has been approved and, as such, this MEC does not address all of the editorial items/issues that will be reviewed then (i.e., punctuation, grammar, formatting).]

These comments are derived from the *2005 IEEE Standards Style Manual*.
The complete *2005 IEEE Style Manual*, in viewable/downloadable format, can be found at:
<http://standards.ieee.org/guides/style/2005Style.pdf>

1) Items/issues that shall be resolved before the ballot begins

a) Scope and purpose

Please note that the scope of the document must be within (i.e., less than or equal to) the scope of the PAR. The purpose of the document must be within the purpose of the PAR. If the scope is not within that of the PAR, the scope of the document must be updated or the PAR must be updated. Balloters will review the scope during the balloting process as one of their responsibilities.

→ Please review the scope in P1700 in relation to the scope set forth via the PAR. Please review the purpose in P1700 in relation to the purpose set forth via the PAR.

2) Items/issues that shall be resolved before the final recirculation

b) Trademarks

“References to commercial equipment or products in a standard shall be generic and shall not include trademarks or other proprietary designations. Where a sole source exists for essential equipment or materials, it is permissible to supply the name of the trademark owner in a footnote. The proper use guidelines for trademarks shall be determined by the trademark owner. Trademark owners must grant written permission before their trademarks may be referenced in a standard.” (See Clause 7 of *2005 Style Manual*)

→ Please review the use of trademarks in the draft, if applicable.

c) Reproduced tables, figures, or text

Are any of the tables, figures, or text taken from other sources? If so, has permission been secured to use the data?

→ If applicable, please ensure that the necessary and appropriate permissions have been obtained for any reproduced figures, tables, or text. Even if they were used previously, the permissions might need to be updated.

d) Figures in black and white versus color

“Graphics files created in a graphics program should be saved as black and white (at 300 dpi) or gray scale (at 150 dpi) in one of the following formats: Encapsulated PostScript (EPS), Tagged Image File Format (TIFF), or Windows Metafile Format (WMF)...Whenever possible, original art files (from the graphics program used) should also be submitted to the IEEE.” (See 16.1 of *2005 Style Manual*)

→ Please convert any figures currently presented in color, including Figure 1 and Figure 2, to either black and white or gray scale.

e) Normative references (citation in body of standard)

“References are those normative documents that contain material that must be understood and used to implement the standard. Thus, referenced documents are indispensable when applying the standard. Each reference shall be cited, and the role and relationship of each referenced document shall be explained in the body of the standard. (See 10.4.1 of *2005 Style Manual*)

→ Please consider that documents listed in the references clause shall also be cited within the body of the document. If references are not cited normatively, they should be stored in an informative bibliography (annex).

f) Bibliography

An informative bibliography houses any informative documents or reference materials that the working groups consider important supplementary information to standards.

→ Please consider that documents mentioned in standards that are not considered normative references are listed in informative bibliographies. FIPS 199 and/or NIST SP 800-18, NIST SP 800-64, NIST SP 800-37, NIST SP 800-53, NIST SP 800-53A, NIST Brochure: Information Security System Development belong in a bibliography (or normative references)?

g) Definitions

“Definitions shall appear in alphabetical order and the term defined shall be written out completely...Each term shall be numbered as a subclause of the definitions clause. Each definition shall be a brief, self-contained description of the term in question and shall not contain requirements...The following is an example of a correctly styled definitions clause.

3.1 acceleration-insensitive drift rate: The component of systematic drift rate that has no correlation with acceleration. *See also: drift rate; systematic drift rate.*” (See 10.5.2 of *2005 Style Manual*)

→ Please ensure that the definitions are terms with brief and concise descriptions.

h) Definitions (general terminology usage)

“Working groups shall not incorporate terms that were already published in *The Authoritative Dictionary*. However, if the working group feels that including such terms is necessary for effective use of the document, the terms may be placed in an informative annex, entitled Glossary. During mandatory ballot coordination of definitions and terms by SCC10, working groups may be asked to validate the use of terms that already exist, or terms that vary slightly from those that already exist in *The Authoritative Dictionary* [B7]. If the definitions in *The Authoritative Dictionary* [B7] do not reflect usage specific to the document, or if terms used are not defined in *The Authoritative Dictionary* [B7], then appropriate definitions shall be provided.” (See 10.5.1 of the *2005 Style Manual*)

→ Please consider that terms that have already been defined in IEEE standards are included in The Authoritative Dictionary. Instead of repeating the terms found in P1700, please either remove them or consider moving them to an annex. The IEEE 100 is available at http://shop.ieee.org/ieeestore/Product.aspx?product_no=SP1122.

i) Presentation of clauses

“All clause and subclause headings shall consist of a number and a title. The text follows immediately after the subclause title on a new line. Hanging paragraphs (i.e., paragraphs following a main clause head or subhead) should not be used since reference to the text would be ambiguous. It may be necessary to include a subhead with the title “General” to avoid instances of hanging paragraphs...” (See 11.1 of *2005 Style Manual*)

→ Is Clause 4 being divided into subclauses? Organization within Clause 5? The other clauses? Any of the bold text titles meant to be associated with subclause numbers? The subclause numbers are being put in later to match the Table of Content entries? [Please know that IEEE-SA templates are available that include macros for the addition of sequential clauses and subclauses that meet the requirements of IEEE Standards style and formatting. These templates will soon be posted to the IEEE-SA Web site. In the meantime, I am able to e-mail a template to you. Please let me know if this would be useful to you.]

j) Notes

“Explanatory statements may be used in the text for emphasis or to offer informative suggestions about the technical content of the standard. These notes provide additional information to assist the reader with a particular passage and shall not include mandatory requirements. A note in the text is not an official part of the standard; therefore, important information on safety, health, or the environment shall not be included. A note should follow that paragraph to which it belongs, and shall be set apart from the text by introducing the statement with the capitalized word “NOTE—”. Within each subclause, multiple notes in sequence should be numbered “NOTE 1—”, “NOTE 2—”, etc.” (See 18.1 of *2005 Style Manual*)

→ Please consider the use of explanatory statements in P1700, especially within Clause 5 (pg 24, pg 26, pg 29).

k) Different colors of text

At this point in time, all text and figures that appear in standards will be in black and white.

→ Please ensure that all text in P1700 is changed to black and white.

l) Translations

Please consider the translations list found at the very end of P1700. Can these be included within the body of the text?

→ Please be able to provide any additional information about the translation statements. Please consider moving the items within the body of the text.

3) Items/issues that should be resolved before submission to RevCom (not mandatory to secure approval of the project)

m) Abstracts and keywords

“The inclusion of abstracts and keywords in IEEE standards allows the documents to be referenced in a wide range of bibliographic environments, thereby increasing their utility, visibility, and availability to the public. For this reason, abstracts and keywords shall be included on the title page of each standard. Abstracts should be based on the scope and purpose of the standard as

indicated on the PAR; keywords should highlight key terms and phrases from the text of the draft standard.” (Clause 9.2 of *2005 Style Manual*)

→ ***Please provide abstract and keywords for the title page.***

n) Lists

“An ordered list of items within a subclause should be presented in outline form, with items lettered a), b), c), etc. If a further subdivision of the items is necessary, 1), 2), 3); i), ii), iii), etc., should be used to form a tiered list...Dashed lists can be used instead of an ordered list, where applicable. Closing punctuation should be omitted in lists of short items or phrases. Punctuations should be used for sentences.” (See 11.3 of *2005 Style Manual*)

→ ***Please consider the lists found within P1700.***

o) Third person address (voice) versus second or first person.

Standards should be written in third person address and not in second or first person. In other words, the author should use a voice that does not refer to the author or the reader as an individual. There should be no instances of “we” or “I” or “you” found in the document.

→ ***Please rephrase the statement in the scope that includes the pronoun “you.”***

.....
Please note that the following are the next steps for this project.

After you have reviewed/made the required changes, please create the PDF that will be used for the ballot. The draft number used for the PDF should reflect the most current version of the draft (e.g., IEEE P1700/Dx).

Please contact the liaison for this project (a.ortiz@ieee.org), to begin the balloting process.

Please note that compliance with items in Section 1 will be reviewed by the staff liaison when you upload the pdf. The project editor will not review your draft again until the Ballot MEC, which occurs during the Sponsor ballot. The RevCom MEC will occur after you submit the final balloted draft to RevCom.

Thank you and best regards,

Jennie Steinhagen

Program Manager, Document Development / IEEE Standards Activities Department
455 Hoes Lane, Piscataway, NJ 08854 – USA / Email: j.steinhagen@ieee.org